
TO: GENERAL COMMITTEE

SUBJECT: SEA CADETS RELOCATION TO SOUTHSHORE

WARD: #8

PREPARED BY AND KEY CONTACT: J. DEVROOM, SENIOR PROJECT MANAGER (EXT. 4531)
J. LE, PROJECT MANAGER

SUBMITTED BY: R. PEWS, DIRECTOR OF CORPORATE FACILITIES

GENERAL MANAGER APPROVAL: D. MCALPINE, GENERAL MANAGER OF COMMUNITY AND CORPORATE SERVICES

CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER APPROVAL: M. PROWSE, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

RECOMMENDED MOTION

1. That “Option B – Southshore Community Centre Addition” be endorsed in principle to guide the additional planning, design and construction of the Southshore Community Centre Addition as per Appendix “A” and Appendix “C” to Staff Report FAC003-24.
2. That additional funding in the amount of \$300,000.00 be approved under Project #FC1318 for the further planning and design of “Option B – Southshore Community Centre Addition”, to be funded from the Tax Capital Reserve.
3. That staff report back to General Committee for future construction funding approval of “Option B – Southshore Community Centre Addition” once costing is refined through the design process.
4. That staff continue to meet with the stakeholders to obtain additional input on design and program requirements.

PURPOSE & BACKGROUND

Report Overview

5. The purpose of this staff report is to provide an update to General Committee regarding the high-level cost estimates and potential relocation sites for the Sea Cadets and the Navy League of Canada operations, incorporating input from relevant stakeholders.
6. On October 4, 2023, City Council adopted motion 23-G-206 regarding SEA CADETS FACILITY RELOCATION OPTIONS AND YOUTH SPORT CONSULTATION as follows:
 - a) That staff in the Corporate Facilities Department be directed to develop a plan, in consultation with the Sea Cadets and the Navy League of Canada, to relocate the Navy cadets to a new building east of Military Heritage Park including a parade ground and multi-use outdoor space and report back to the Infrastructure and Community Investment Committee.

ANALYSIS

7. Staff have been directed to explore the potential of a new facility of roughly 600 square metres, located east of the existing Southshore Community Centre. In reviewing the site, staff also identified the potential to expand the existing Southshore Centre structure, which already houses the Barrie Rowing Club, Barrie Canoe and Kayak Club and the Rotary Clubs of Barrie and Huronia and has ready access to Kempenfelt Bay. The purpose of the directed option and alternative option investigated is to provide a new facility for the Sea Cadets and the Navy League of Canada. Parks Planning staff have developed the directed parade ground and multi-use outdoor space component of this project and are reporting back on that component through separate staff report DEV019-24.

Site Investigations and Due Diligence

8. The Lake Simcoe Region Conservation Authority (LSRCA) Regulated Area includes the entire waterfront and extends from Kempenfelt Bay south to the north side of the Southshore Community Centre. LSRCA acceptance of the plan is required to obtain approvals, as is compliance with any mitigation measures identified through their review that are required to meet the intent of the Lake Simcoe Protection Plan and LSRCA Regulation Implementation Guidelines (Ontario Regulation 179/06).
9. Due to the proximity of the Southshore Community Centre and the Allandale Station Park to the Allandale Historic Train Station, a Stage 2 Archaeological Assessment is required for any proposed developments. Stage 2 involves the physical assessment of a property to determine if archaeological resources are present. If archaeological or indigenous cultural materials are not found, they may not require any further work beyond Stage 2 documentation. Should archaeological or indigenous cultural material be found, Stage 3 and 4 archaeological assessments may be required.
10. Several additional site investigations and due diligence studies will be required to properly inform the design and construction of both a new stand-alone building and an addition to the Southshore Centre. The following studies and investigations may be required: Geotechnical Report, Hydrogeological Study, Groundwater Management Plan, Environmental Impact Study, Species at Risk Study, Topographic and Property Surveys, Environmental Site Assessment Phase I and II, Due Diligence Risk Assessment, Soil Characterization Report, Excess Soil Destination Assessment Report, Soil Vapour Intrusion Assessment, Floodplain Analysis, Functional Servicing Report, Traffic Study and a Heritage Impact Assessment.

Concept Development – Option A

11. **Option A – 600 Square Metre Stand Alone Sea Cadets Building** involves the construction of a new stand-alone building to the east of the existing Southshore Community Centre as shown in the Site Plan under Appendix “A”.
12. A new driveway and parking lot will be required to accommodate a new building. Due to the distance from the road, the length of a driveway would be significant and would be a significant additional cost to the project. The addition of a new entrance off Lakeshore Drive would also necessitate the need for a traffic impact analysis to help prevent potential congestion on Lakeshore Drive due to turning traffic at the new entry point.
13. New hydro, water and sewer service would be required to service the building. As a result of the slope from the road to the building, a sanitary connection may not be feasible without a pumping station. Due to the significant distance between the road and the proposed building location, the cost of servicing would be significant.

14. The location for the proposed new facility is approximately 8 metres above the lake elevation. The difference in elevation between the proposed building would present considerable difficulties in accessing the lake and transporting sailboats between the lake and the building.
15. The preliminary cost estimate for Option A, including construction cost value developed by Ryder Levett Bucknall, is **\$5,868,531.73**. The summary of this estimated cost is provided in more detail in Appendix "B". This figure was developed through a Class D cost estimate, representing an accuracy of +/- 25% to 30%, which is appropriate for the level of detail available. As the planning and design phases progress, further details will become available to provide a more accurate and reliable estimated cost.

Concept Development – Option B

16. **Option B – 600 Square Metre Southshore Community Centre Addition** involves the construction of a northerly addition to the basement of the existing building as shown in the Site Plan under Appendix "A". An addition to the existing building to accommodate the operations of the Sea Cadets has many cost benefits such as:
 - a) Utilization of existing services. The Southshore Community Centre is supplied with hydro, water and sewer therefore costs to service are reduced in comparison with Option A.
 - b) The Southshore Community Centre has a significant amount of parking. Additional parking would not be needed to accommodate an additional tenant; however, it is important to note that the existing parking is a paid parking lot. This parking lot will be available for use by all visitors to the waterfront on a first-come, first-serve basis. Anyone who is not a Barrie resident must pay for parking. Space exists on site to expand this lot in the future if required.
 - c) Water access is already in place, however additional docking would be required to accommodate an additional tenant.
 - d) An addition to the north side of the building would result in an expanded upper patio area. This may be a significant benefit to the rental space on the upper floor. Weddings and events would have the added use of a large patio with the backdrop of Kempenfelt Bay.
17. The location for the proposed addition is approximately 5 metres above the lake elevation. The increased slope that will be introduced between the proposed expansion and Kempenfelt Bay is significant, and the detailed design will need to accommodate lake access and the transportation of boats between the lake and the building.
18. The preliminary cost estimate for Option B, including construction cost estimate developed by Ryder Levett Bucknall is **\$4,554,214.66**. The summary for this estimated cost is provided in more detail in Appendix "C". This figure was developed through a Class D cost estimate, representing an accuracy of +/- 25% to 30%, which is appropriate for the level of detail available. As the planning and design phases progress, further details will become available to provide a more accurate and reliable estimated cost.

Stakeholder Engagement

19. Sea Cadets representative, Dianne Chislett, alongside City staff, conducted a tour of the Southshore Community Centre on December 15th, 2023. The main and lower floors were explored, including current tenant spaces, training room and community hall. Discussions primarily focused on preliminary programming needs such as boat quantities, events, and space allocation for Sea Cadets and Navy League activities. Additionally, a post-meeting tour was arranged the same day to visit the existing Sea Cadet facility. The purpose was to conduct a preliminary inventory assessment, evaluate current layout, and gather information for planning.
20. City staff from Corporate Facilities and Recreation & Culture Services also convened virtually with various stakeholders affiliated with the Southshore Community Centre.
21. Present at the meeting were representatives from the Barrie Canoe & Kayak Club (BCKC), Barrie Rowing Club (BRC), the Rotary Club of Barrie, and the Rotary Club of Barrie Huronia.
22. The Barrie Canoe & Kayak Club (BCKC) and the Barrie Rowing Club (BRC) each occupy space on the lower level of the Southshore Community Centre with access to Kempenfelt Bay on the north side of the building. The space is primarily utilized as storage space for canoes, kayaks, and boats. A floating dock is shared between the two groups which is accessed by an asphalted path.
23. The Rotary Club of Barrie, and the Rotary Club of Barrie Huronia occupy the upper level on the south side of the Community Centre for their regular meetings. The space is primarily utilized to host a variety of community events, social functions, and organization meetings.
24. The Barrie Canoe & Kayak, Barrie Rowing and Rotary Clubs each contributed to the capital costs for the original construction works associated with the Southshore Community Centre. The organizations have an existing lease agreement with the City for the utilization of their respective spaces/meetings with the terms and conditions as well as fees established in the agreement.
25. The main level of the Southshore Community Centre is also utilized by the City of Barrie as a rental space to host a variety of social functions such as meetings, seminars, banquets, and weddings. Rental bookings at the Southshore Community Centre are in high demand as the facility offers a panoramic view of Kempenfelt Bay.
26. The two options that city staff have explored were presented to all stakeholders in attendance. Option A which incorporated a new facility for the Sea Cadets operations that would be located to the east of the Southshore Community Centre would have little impact on the operations of each of the stakeholders. Option B which would incorporate the construction of an addition to the Southshore Community Centre would have a direct impact on the operations of the various stakeholders. A preliminary layout was shared with the group to provide a general concept of Option B. Each group identified areas of impact to their operations.
27. Discussions regarding Option B during the stakeholder engagement meeting included the following:
 - a) Shown in a conceptual plan (Appendix A), the addition would extend approximately 13 metres towards Kempenfelt Bay and approximately 47 metres across the rear of the Southshore Community Centre.

-
- b) The existing space is segregated into two tenant areas with a shared training room space. The addition will provide additional space allowing a third tenant. All existing and new user groups would maintain or marginally increase their existing space allocations. The new space layout will involve a modified plan through the process of the schematic design phase which will be undertaken by an Architect. All stakeholders will be engaged during this process to determine the needs of each group and establish a space design that will facilitate their operations.
 - c) The existing training room will be relocated and dedicated to the Barrie Canoe and Kayak Club and the Barrie Rowing Club as a shared space.
 - d) Tenant improvements in the current space, undertaken and funded by the Barrie Canoe and Kayak Club and the Barrie Rowing Club would be salvaged where possible and reinstated. Through the design process, every effort would be made to maintain existing tenant improvements.
 - e) Existing racking owned by the Barrie Canoe and Kayak Club and the Barrie Rowing Club would be incorporated into the design layout and would be reinstated.
 - f) The process of construction will cause significant interruptions to the operations of the Barrie Canoe and Kayak Club and the Barrie Rowing Club. Phasing of construction or alternate arrangements would be investigated and coordinated to minimize impact on programming and club operations.
 - g) A building addition while maintaining the existing lower-level floor elevation would require an increase in slope from the building to the water's edge. The increased slope will present difficulties in carrying or transporting boats, kayaks and canoes from the water to the building. Further design development is required to mitigate this issue.
 - h) The need to increase the number of washrooms will be addressed through the building code review process completed by the designing Architect.
 - i) To allow for the increase in occupant use at the waterfront, additional docking would be required. The existing floating dock was purchased and is shared by the Barrie Canoe and Kayak Club and the Barrie Rowing Club. An allowance for the purchase of docks has been included in the project cost estimate. Verification of this cost will be completed through the design development process.
28. Several stakeholders provided additional feedback through email after the scheduled meeting. This feedback further reinforced the discussion held at the stakeholder meeting and provided additional information on the size, function and programming of the respective clubs.
29. City staff committed to stakeholders that should 'Option B – Southshore Community Centre Addition' be endorsed in principle, the City would facilitate future stakeholder sessions to obtain additional input on design and program requirements.

Project Delivery Method

30. It is recommended that a Design-Bid-Build approach be used to allow for adequate design considerations and stakeholder engagement. Design-bid-build projects involve hiring an architect to complete comprehensive design and undergo stakeholder engagement before construction. This will ensure that all needs are met for a successful project.

ENVIRONMENTAL AND CLIMATE CHANGE IMPACT MATTERS

31. The following environmental and/or climate change impact matters have been considered in the development of the recommendation:
- a) Both options will increase the use of the waterfront through additional dock space which will have an environmental impact on the lake vegetation and shoreline habitats. The Department of Fisheries and Oceans Canada (DFO) will need to be consulted.
 - b) Both options are within the LSRCA Regulated Area. The project must comply with the Lake Simcoe Protection Plan and LSRCA Regulation Implementation Guidelines (Ontario Regulation 179/06).
 - c) Both options are within Source Water Protection areas further classified as Wellhead Protection Areas and Significant Groundwater Recharge Areas. This must be considered as design and construction methods are determined.

ALTERNATIVES

32. The following alternative is available for consideration by General Committee:

Alternative #1

General Committee could alter the proposed recommendation by endorsing **Option A – Stand Alone Sea Cadets Building**.

Although this alternative is available, Option A is not recommended due to the cost premium the option commands. Added costs associated with building services, site works, parking and water access are significant and would be required under Option A.

FINANCIAL

33. The cost to proceed with the further planning and detailed design of “Option B – Southshore Community Centre Addition” is an additional \$300,000.00. This value is included in the preliminary project cost estimate of **\$4,554,214.66**. It is recommended that the funding source for this design be the Tax Capital Reserve. However, the Tax Capital Reserve is already overcommitted and has insufficient funds to address the current commitments. As such, if the construction phase is approved to proceed, other projects that have previously been identified as a priority will need to be deferred or deleted or the City will need to consider incurring additional debt to finance projects within the capital plan. The current project number FC1318 has an approved \$200,000 budget for feasibility investigations. There is currently \$153,946 remaining which will be allocated to additional feasibility and site due diligence investigations related to the Sea Cadet Relocation, as well as a portion of the detailed design phase of the project.
34. The summary of estimated project costs for Option A – Standalone Sea Cadets Building & Option B – Southshore Community Centre Addition are provided under Appendices “B” & “C”.
35. Staff will report back to General Committee for additional funding approval to proceed with construction of “Option B – Southshore Community Centre Addition”, once costing is refined through the additional planning and design phases.

LINKAGE TO 2022-2026 STRATEGIC PLAN

36. The recommendation(s) included in this Staff Report support the following goals identified in the 2022-2026 Strategic Plan:
- Infrastructure Investments
 - Responsible Governance
 - Thriving Community
37. The recommendations of this staff report support the infrastructure investments, responsible governance and thriving community strategic plan goals by renewing community recreational infrastructure and reducing capital costs through a more economical project delivery strategy.



APPENDIX "A"
SEA CADETS FACILITY RELOCATION OPTIONS



APPENDIX "B"
OPTION A – STANDALONE SEA CADETS BUILDING COST ESTIMATE

Option A – 600 Square Metre Stand Alone Sea Cadets Building		
Item	Task	Cost
1	HARD COSTS (Construction)	
2	Hard Construction Cost	\$ 3,566,861.00
3	Estimated Net Cost	\$ 3,566,861.00
4	General Requirements (10%)	\$ 356,686.00
5	Contractors Fees (5%)	\$ 178,345.05
6	Bonding and Insurance (1.5%)	\$ 53,502.92
7	Construction Contingency (10%)	\$ 356,686.00
8	Estimate Total Construction Cost	\$ 945,228.97
9	New Docks	\$ 325,000.00
10	Boat Transportation	\$ 45,500.00
	HARD COSTS SUBTOTAL	\$ 4,512,089.97
	SOFT COSTS	
12	Municipal Charges	\$ 53,505.00
13	Consulting Fees and Expenses	\$ 380,584.00
14	Specialty Consultants	\$ 82,263.00
15	Project Management	\$ 142,674.00
16	Owner Supplied Furnishing, Fixtures, and Equipment	\$ 436,941.00
17	Contract Administration & Site Inspections (3%)	\$ 135,362.70
18	Operational Expenses	\$ 48,153.00
19	Project Soft Cost Contingency	\$ 110,822.00
	SOFT COSTS SUBTOTAL	\$ 1,254,942.00
	HARD & SOFT COSTS TOTAL	\$ 5,767,031.97,
	HST (NON-RECOVERABLE 1.7602%)	\$ 101,499.76
	GRAND TOTAL	\$ 5,868,531.73

APPENDIX "C"
OPTION B – SOUTHSORE COMMUNITY CENTRE ADDITION COST ESTIMATE

Option B – 600 Square Metre Southshore Community Building Addition		
Item	Task	Cost
	HARD COSTS (Construction)	
1	Demolition	\$ 254,439.00
2	Addition	\$ 2,054,652.00
3	Estimated Net Cost	\$ 2,309,091.00
4	General Requirements (10%)	\$ 230,909.00
5	Contractors Fees (5%)	\$ 115,455.00
6	Bonding and Insurance (1.5%)	\$ 34,636.00
7	Construction Contingency (10%)	\$ 269,009.00
8	Estimate Total Construction Cost	\$ 2,959,100.00
9	New Docks	\$ 325,000.00
10	Boat Transportation	\$ 45,500.00
	HARD COSTS SUBTOTAL	\$ 3,284,100.00
	SOFT COSTS	
12	Municipal Charges	\$ 44,387.00
13	Consulting Fees and Expenses	\$ 315,736.00
14	Specialty Consultants	\$ 68,247.00
15	Project Management	\$ 118,364.00
16	Owner Supplied Furnishing, Fixtures, and Equipment	\$ 362,490.00
17	Contract Administration & Site Inspections (3%)	\$ 104,727.00
18	Operational Expenses	\$ 39,948.00
19	Project Soft Cost Contingency	\$ 91,939.00
	SOFT COSTS SUBTOTAL	\$ 1,145,838.00
	HARD & SOFT COSTS TOTAL	\$ 4,475,438.00
	HST (NON-RECOVERABLE 1.7602%)	\$ 78,776.66
	GRAND TOTAL	\$ 4,554,214.66