

May 05, 2014

Page: 1 File: C11-TRA Pending #:

TO: GENERAL COMMITTEE

SUBJECT: BARRIE TRANSIT SYSTEM UPDATE

WARD: n/a

PREPARED BY AND KEY

CONTACT:

D. BURTON, MANAGER OF TRANSIT

Ext. 4352

SUBMITTED BY: D. BURTON, DIRECTOR OF FACILITIES AND TRANSIT (ACTING)

GENERAL MANAGER APPROVAL:

K. BRADLEY BA, MLA , GENERAL MANAGER OF INFRASTRUCTURE

& GROWTH MANAGEMENT (ACTING)

R. FORWARD, MBA, M.Sc., P. Eng., GENERAL MANAGER OF

**COMMUNITY & CORPORATE SERVICES** 

CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER APPROVAL:

CARLA LADD, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

1. The purpose of this staff report is to provide General Committee with an update on the Plan for Transit since the launch in August of 2013. The report outlines service improvements undertaken by staff since the launch; discusses the financial and service performance of the system to date; and recommend actions to improve the reliability, ridership, and financial performance of the system. Feedback was received from the public over the past several weeks and this feedback is reflected in the proposed route revisions. This report will further recommend steps to advance Barrie Transit using a strategic business plan approach.

#### **System Performance and Proposed Route Revisions:**

- 2. From December 2013- March 2014, reliability for Barrie Transit improved to 72% up from 66% observed during September to December 2013. As a comparator, OC Transpo currently reports 65% on-time service reliability for July to December 2013.
- 3. Many enhancements have been put in place since the launch of the new service including smart bus technologies such as the Automated Vehicle Locator (AVL) system, automated next stop call system, and an online live bus portal. New customer service improvements were also implemented; all in an effort to increase knowledge base for planning, scheduling, and managing customer expectations by making better informed decisions.
- 4. The proposed route revision improvements include:
  - a) Greater connections to earlier GO train service from both Allandale Station and Barrie South GO.
  - b) Schedule adjustment to allow for increased early morning service to South Barrie employment lands.
  - c) Increased direct system connectivity between south and north Barrie via the downtown Terminal at 24 Maple Avenue, reducing the number of transfers required.
  - d) Combining routes 8 & 10 to create a single more reliable route and improved schedule that directly addresses the concerns expressed by the public regarding the poor reliability of route 10. Additionally the new single route will provide service to all major transfer



May 05, 2014

Page: 2 File: C11-TRA Pending #:

destinations as well as medical, employment and residential areas. The value of creating this route will also allow flexibility in the future when considering the addition of stat holiday service or reducing the level of service offered on weekends.

e) No additional contract cost.

## Ridership Data:

- 5. 2013 ridership data shows a decrease of 3% from 2012.
- 6. The ridership data is starting to show a recovery in ridership levels. Despite the unusually harsh winter, the ridership levels have increased by 4% since the last route revisions in December 2013.

#### **Financial Performance:**

- 7. Due to lower than anticipated ridership numbers, the extremely harsh winter, and Council amendments to the budget for transit, there is a projected revenue shortfall for 2014.
- 8. In 2013 the Provincial Gas Tax Fund was made a permanent funding source from the Province to help to offset the cost of delivering municipal transit services.
- 9. The variance in 2014 is recommended to be funded up to \$800,000 from the Provincial Gas Tax Reserve Account which is forecast to have a balance at the end of 2014 of about \$4.5 Million with no planned financial commitments for these funds.
- 10. Further, to allow for continued system performance improvements including reliability and route revisions, a freeze on Barrie Transit fares is recommended until May 1, 2015, pending a review through the business plan. An increase in fares at this point in time may result in a further decline in ridership levels

## **Moving Forward:**

- 11. A long term strategic approach to building and sustaining ridership as well as managing and projecting transit costs/revenues is recommended through the preparation of a 5 year Strategic Business Plan for Barrie Transit to address the following:
  - a) Fare Strategy
  - b) Marketing, Ridership Growth and Branding Strategy
  - c) Transit Customer Service Strategy
  - d) Financial Plan
  - e) Provincial Gas Tax Funding and Reserve Strategy
  - f) Fleet Asset Renewal Strategy

#### **RECOMMENDED MOTION**

- 12. That staff be directed to implement the proposed system route revisions and improvements identified in this report in 2014 without an increase to Barrie Transit operating costs.
- 13. That staff be directed to prepare a five (5) year business plan for Barrie Transit, known as the 2015-2020 Transit Business Plan, with the Plan to include the following elements as identified in this report:
  - a) Fare Strategy



May 05, 2014

Page: 3 File: C11-TRA Pending #:

- b) Marketing, Ridership Growth and Branding Strategy
- c) Transit Customer Service Strategy
- d) Financial Plan
- e) Provincial Gas Tax Funding and Reserve strategy
- f) Fleet Asset Renewal Strategy
- 14. That a project in the amount of \$125,000 be added to the 2014 capital plan to retain external consulting services to assist with the development of the 2015- 2020 Transit Business Plan and that this project be funded from the Provincial Gas Tax Reserve Fund (11-05-0595).
- 15. That staff present the 2015-2020 Transit Business Plan to Council for approval as part of the 2015 Business Plan process.
- 16. That notwithstanding motion 14-G-017 as amended concerning the 2014 Business Plan:
  - a) That Transit fares remain at the 2013 Council approved rates until May 1, 2015 pending the review of the five (5) year business plan for Transit and the 2014 Fees By-law be amended accordingly. And that \$100,000 in projected revenue lost due to this deferral be funded from the Provincial Gas Tax Reserve Fund (11-05-0595).
  - b) That any potential variance in Transits net operating budget as a result of decreased revenue be funded from the Provincial Gas Tax Reserve Fund (11-05-0595) to an upset limit of \$800,000.
  - c) That \$25,000 to be funded from the Provincial Gas Tax Reserve Fund (11-05-0595) be approved for the production of communications materials to inform and educate the public regarding the proposed changes to the Transit system.

#### **PURPOSE & BACKGROUND**

- 17. The purpose of this staff report is to provide General Committee with an update on the Plan for Transit since the launch in August of 2013. This report will outline service improvements undertaken by staff since the launch; discuss the financial and service performance of the system to date; and recommend actions to improve the reliability, ridership, and financial performance of the system. This report will further recommend steps to advance Transit using a business planning approach.
- 18. The Plan for Transit was developed through 2012 and 2013 with its launch on August 17, 2013. The Plan for Transit was implemented to address key challenges with the previous system that included:
  - a) Route system that does not accommodate growth
  - b) Lack of direct routes
  - c) Lack of two directional services along routes
  - d) Long trip times & wait times
  - e) Poor service frequency
  - f) No exterior transit hubs & lack of transfer points
  - g) Absence of coverage in south end of city
  - h) Minimal direct connections to GO Stations
  - i) Unreliable & unpredictable route schedules
  - j) Low Customer satisfaction
- 19. The Plan for Transit has met most of the objectives above but there are challenges with a number of the routes (i.e. 3, 4, 6, and 10) especially during the peak period of 1 to 7pm that need to be

## STAFF REPORT FACTR002-14 May 05, 2014



Page: 4
File: C11-TRA
Pending #:

addressed to increase customer satisfaction and ridership. The key issue is the reliability of the system in not maintaining schedules that has resulted in long wait times, missed connections, and longer than planned travel.

- 20. Staff have and continue to monitor, track and respond to customer and transit operator feedback which led to informed changes to routes 4, 5, 6 and 10 on two separate occasions, the first in November 2013 and the most recent in December 2013.
- 21. Other enhancements launched as part of the Plan for Transit include smart bus technologies such as the Automated Vehicle Locator (AVL) system, automated next stop call system, and an online live bus portal. In addition, new customer service measures were implemented such as dedicated voice response and a direct email connection at transit@barrie.ca.
- 22. Prior to the launch of the smart bus technologies the City relied heavily on visual inspections by staff and public feedback to monitor the on-time reliability, route travel times, and investigate customer complaints relating to delayed or missed trips. The ability to monitor and analyse system performance data was labour intensive and only able to capture periodic samples of data based on limited resource availability.

## **ANALYSIS**

- 23. In December 2013, staff identified to Council that it would require a minimum of six months of data before being able to undertake preliminary analysis, provide an initial status update, and make recommendations to improve the service and the routes for Council consideration. Since the launch staff analysed data on the following items:
  - a) Service reliability (on-time performance)
  - b) Ridership
  - c) Route patterns, running time, and service coverage
  - d) Financial results

## **Service Reliability**

- 24. Through the use of the new AVL system, staff have been able to track and log data relative to travel times from stop to stop, checkpoint to checkpoint, and from major hub to major hub destination. By having this data archived, staff are able to access this data through the City's service partner, Strategic Mapping Inc., to measure and report on a performance metric that has not been able to be reported on in the past service reliability.
- 25. It has been concluded in many studies that service reliability is a more effective and cost-efficient way to improve rider satisfaction and transit demand than increasing service frequency. Improvements in service reliability can lead to the attraction of more passengers, especially choice riders while excessive service unreliability can lead to the loss of both captive and choice passengers.
- 26. Service reliability as defined by passengers is a system that:
  - a) Can be easily accessed by passengers at both origin and destination
  - b) Arrives predictably resulting in short waiting time (on-time performance)
  - c) Has short running time
  - d) Has consistent running times
- 27. On-time performance is measured by tracking actual time of arrival at various check points in the system and comparing them to the scheduled data. If a bus arrives at any point between zero (0) to five (5) minutes after a scheduled time of arrival it is considered on-time.

# The City of BARRIE

## STAFF REPORT FACTR002-14 May 05, 2014

Page: 5 File: C11-TRA Pending #:

- 28. The reliability of transit services is very sensitive to expected and unexpected factors. These factors include distance, passenger activity, time of day, transportation system (e.g. congestion, number of signalized intersections), number of actual stops made, and weather.
- 29. Through August to November 2013 staff analyzed and trended service reliability data in response to customer feedback regarding concerns with on-time performance. The analysis demonstrated an average of 66% on-time performance leading staff to implement no-cost minor route revisions in an effort to improve this performance measurement.
- 30. After the last route revisions were completed in December 2013, staff monitored this data from December to March 2014 which included harsher than normal winter weather conditions. During this period the service reliability improved to seventy two percent (72%) indicating that the revisions made were achieving results.
- 31. As the City does not currently have an identified service standard for service reliability, staff will be reviewing this matter in the upcoming five (5) year business plan for transit outlined later in this report. This service level standard will fit with the performance metrics identified in the P3 service contract specific to on-time service reliability.
- 32. Although few transit service providers report on this metric, staff deems it important as increased reliability builds confidence in the system leading to ridership growth. As a single comparator, OC Transpo currently reports 65% on-time service reliability for a period from July1 to Dec 31, 2013.

## Ridership

- 33. In 2012, Barrie Transit had more than 2.7 million trips. A trip is calculated using formulas provided to us from the Canadian Urban Transit Authority (CUTA) and utilized by all public sector comparators for the purpose of obtaining ridership data. With the advancement of technology and the implementation of a new fare box system as part of the Transit P3 project, staff will be able report much more accurately on ridership data including the ability to identify boarding's by stop. Until such time the method provided by CUTA offers a mathematical means of calculating this data.
- 34. In the Plan for Transit staff report LTF001-12 that resulted in motion 12-G-052 staff identified in Table 1.0 of that report a revenue increase which would require a ridership increase over 2012 levels of approximately 265,000 trips. This was to be planned to be achieved in the last six months of 2013.
- 35. Actual ridership for the last quarter of 2013 dropped by 12% or 84,000 trips in comparison to the same period in 2012. This resulted in a year to year reduction in ridership of 3% or 85,500 trips. Staff Report LTF001-12 also projected 2014 costs that were used for developing the 2014 budget which identified another 9% increase of approximately 265,000 trips anticipated for 2014 for a total increase of 18% or 530,000 passenger trips over the 2012 level.
- 36. Staff met with CUTA executives earlier this year and in discussions it was noted that based on their experience with other transit system overhauls that an initial drop in ridership could be expected until passengers familiarize themselves with the new routes, travel patterns and new schedules. A key element to the recovery of ridership is on-time service reliability.
- 37. The ridership data is starting to show a recovery in ridership levels. This analysis shows that although the ridership for the first two months of 2014 remains lower than the same period in 2013 ridership levels have increased by 4% since the last route revisions in December 2013 to 8% below the same period last year. This was also during a period of extreme winter conditions that caused most systems to experience reduced ridership levels.

# The City of BARRIE

## STAFF REPORT FACTR002-14 May 05, 2014

Page: 6 File: C11-TRA Pending #:

38. It is anticipated that with the proposed route revisions outlined in this report and an increased focus on service reliability that the upward trend in ridership levels should continue through 2014. It should be noted however that current Transit staff are not optimistic that the levels identified in Staff Report LTF001-12 will be reached as it forecasted an 18% ridership increase over 2012 levels.

## Route Patterns, Schedules, and Service Coverage

- 39. In addition to the reliability data outlined in this report, staff since the launch has been pro-actively seeking and compiling customer feedback received through phone, email, social media, and written form with respect to the patterns and coverage of the routes. With this information staff determined that there was a strong enough need to modify the majority of the routes and present them to General Committee for consideration.
- 40. Building on the work completed as part of the December route updates, staff met early on in 2014 with the Transit Working Group to discuss the service and begin developing possible route modifications that could be considered to improve service reliability. It was proposed at this meeting that the following steps be taken by staff prior to submitting the proposed changes to General Committee:
  - a) Meetings with First Transit senior staff to discuss their comments on the operation and reliability of the current routes
  - b) On-going review by First Transit schedulers
  - c) Model proposed routes complete with schedules and checkpoints for testing
  - d) On-Road testing of routes with stops at every second bus stop location for a period of 15-20 seconds to simulate passenger boarding's
  - e) Hold public Information sessions to receive public feedback on the proposed routes.
- 41. The route development process included a staff prepared route structure that was developed using industry transit planning best practices, then revised with the input received from First Transit, and further revised following the on-road testing. This plan was then issued to the public through different media channels as well as five public information sessions for feedback and input on the proposed design. The summary of the top trending themes from the feedback received can be found in Appendix "A" as well as the resulting changes implemented or rationale as to why some items couldn't be addressed at this time. The revisions required from the public feedback was then included in the updated route plan and once again put through on-road testing. The recommended route network design is included as Appendix "B" of this report.
- 42. The proposed routes have been planned utilizing a different approach then that used as part of the Plan for Transit. The initial route design under the Plan for Transit was modelled to run from stop to stop with a recovery period at the end of the route to allow the bus to get back on schedule should it fall behind while driving the route. This approach although proven in the industry does not allow for the bus to ever get back on schedule within the route itself.
- 43. The new routes have been planned by scheduling more frequent but smaller recovery periods at major checkpoints (e.g. hubs) within the route to allow the bus catch back up to the scheduled arrival times. This method will further reduce the compounding effect observed with the current routes during peak periods.
- 44. The proposed transit system changes remain consistent with the aforementioned goals and the objectives of the Plan for Transit, but also reflect strategies to improve service reliability, route patterns, customer satisfaction, and service coverage. When analysing the route patterns it became clear that the goal of two directional routes on 95% of the service area was difficult to meet while maintaining service coverage due to the road network within the north end of the City. As such small sections of the routes have to include one directional loops at the end point of the



May 05, 2014

Page: 7 File: C11-TRA Pending #:

line to act as a collector segment. This was done systematically to ensure that any one directional loop is done through a service area with high ridership where two directional services was a challenge.

- 45. The routes were also planned with a greater consideration for the road network within the north section of the City. When monitoring and road testing these sections it became apparent that due to the road network (e.g. high number of signalized intersections) in the north end of the City a much lower average travel speed was observed. This factor was taking into consideration when planning and modifying the routes.
- 46. Other considerations that went into the planning of the routes included:
  - a) Greater connectivity between the north and south half of the City by bringing more connections back to the downtown terminal.
  - b) More direct routes from north to south reducing the number of transfers required which reduces the impact on the riders should the service experience any unplanned on-time service reliability issues.
  - c) Improved service to the Northeast end of the City by offering two routes that service the areas of Blake and Johnson street
  - d) Ensure the efficient use of resources by servicing areas of higher ridership and adjusting service hours to align with established travel patterns and ridership data
  - No increase to the operating cost of the transit service or any increase in fleet.

## **Financial Performance**

47. As part of the Leisure, Transit & Facilities 2013 Plan for Transit Program Change Form costs were identified and approved increasing the annualized amounts for both revenue and expenditures within Transit Operations. As part of the 2013 business plan deliberations Council amended the motion to limit the weekday morning start time to 5:45am with a net reduction to the program change form of \$63,000. This net reduction was then applied only to the expense line and not the corresponding revenue line. The table below outlines the impact to these line items for Transit in both 2013 and 2014.

	2013 Base Budget	2013 PCF	2013 Approved Budget	2014 Built from Plan in SR LTF001-12
Expense	\$11,230,500	\$1,137,000	\$12,367,500	\$14,138,000
Fare Revenue	\$5,501,400	\$500,000	\$6,001,400	\$6,601,255
Gas Tax Contribution	\$775,000	100,000	\$875,000	\$975,000

- 48. Outlined in the table above is an increase in annual revenue projections of \$500,000 for 2013 to be realized in the period after the implementation of the Plan for Transit. This additional revenue is in addition to the 4% increase included in the Transit Operations budget as part of the 2013 Business Plan. This 4% increase is attributed to a modest ridership growth anticipated for 2013 along with a fare increase of \$0.15 to bring the 2013 fare up to \$3.00. The combined impact of both the Business Plan and the Program Change Form was an increase of 12% over the 2012 budget levels of \$5.2M.
- 49. With 2013 final year-end financial reports being made available, staff completed their analysis of Transit operations accounts. The findings during this review indicate that Transit has only realized a 1% or \$50,000 increase in fare revenue over 2012 budget leaving a variance on



May 05, 2014

Page: 8 File: C11-TRA Pending #:

adjusted revenue of 11% or \$710,000. For 2013 however it is also been identified that the expenditures were also under plan as a result of a delayed implementation of the Plan for Transit. Based on this delay Transit Operations achieved a savings of almost \$300,000 leaving Transit with a net operating variance at approximately \$510,000 for 2013.

- 50. Based on the 2013 results it was necessary to review the impacts of those trends on the 2014 Business Plan adopted by Council. The 2014 Transit Operations budget includes increases to both expenditures and revenues as per the recommendations identified in staff report LTF001-12. Through the 2014 budget development there was no data available to suggest these numbers were not achievable.
- 51. The table below outlines the anticipated variance in 2014 Transit revenues based on updated projections assuming a 5% ridership increase over 2013 actual levels.

	2013 Actual	2014 Budget As per LTF001-12	New 2014 projections	Variance (Budget to Revised Projections)
Revenue	\$5,335,910	\$6,500,000	\$5,605,000	\$895,000

- 52. Based on the updated financial projections for 2014, staff are recommending the any variance to an upset limit of \$800,000 be funded from the Provincial Gas Tax Reserve account to offset this variance. With the current commitments from the Provincial Gas Tax Reserve account it is forecast that by the end of 2014 there will be a balance of approximately \$4.5M with no planned financial commitments of these funds.
- 53. In 2013 it was announced that the Provincial Gas Tax Fund program would become a permanent funding source from the Province to help offset the cost of delivering municipal transit services. The City of Barrie receives on an annual basis approximately \$2M of Provincial Gas Tax funding that can only be used towards municipal transit services.
- 54. Since the program's inception in 2002, the City of Barrie has used these funds annually to in part offset Transit operational costs and to contribute to the reserve account. With this stable source of funding available for Transit the application of this fund will be analysed in more detail as part of the Business Plan for Transit with the intent of recommending to Council a fiscally responsible approach.

#### **Transit Business Plan**

- 55. With the implementation of the smart bus technology in 2013 and the pending award of the Transit P3 performance based contract and service change over to occur in 2015 staff felt it is important to establish and apply a business minded approach for Transit. As such staff are proposing that a five (5) year business plan be created for Transit highlighting the following elements;
  - a) Fare Strategy
  - b) Marketing, Ridership Growth and Branding Strategy
  - c) Transit Customer Service Strategy
  - d) Financial Plan
  - e) Provincial Gas Tax Funding and Reserve strategy
  - f) Fleet Asset Renewal Strategy
- 56. Staff would like to proceed with this project immediately with the intention of including the 2015-2020 Transit Business Plan as part of the Annual Business Plan to be presented to Council for consideration. Staff strongly feels this approach will allow Barrie Transit to evolve and begin on a



## STAFF REPORT FACTR002-14 May 05, 2014

Page: 9 File: C11-TRA Pending #:

path with vision and purpose to challenge the mode of transportation selected by residents for local in-town travel.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL MATTERS**

57. The environmental matters relating to the recommendations within this report are difficult to quantify but do provide a benefit by reducing emissions through greater use of public transit systems and reducing the number of vehicles on the road.

## **ALTERNATIVES**

58. There are two alternatives available for consideration by General Committee:

#### Alternative #1

General Committee could choose not to proceed with the updated routes outlined in this report and allow the system to maintain a current 72% service reliability.

This alternative is not recommended as this level of service is still demonstrating a reduced level of ridership to that experienced in 2012.

## Alternative #2

General Committee could choose not to proceed with the updated routes outlined in this report and request that staff report back on cost savings by reducing services levels to reduce expenditures.

This alternative is not recommended as a reduction in service level at this point in time could negatively impact rider confidence in the service and reduce ridership levels lower than that currently being seen.

## **FINANCIAL**

- 59. As noted in the report, Provincial Gas Tax funding can only be used to support Transit services. Therefore, no other municipal services will be directly impacted by a decision to utilize additional PGT funds for the recommended operating and capital expenditures.
- 60. PGT funds allocated to a municipality are not to exceed, based on municipal public transportation spending data set out in the CUTA Fact Books, 75% of municipal own spending on public transportation (from prior fiscal years). The recommendations contained in this report will not adversely affect the amount of PGT funding allocated to the municipality.
- 61. The Provincial Gas Tax Reserve Fund had a balance of \$4.9M at December 31, 2013. The 2014 Business Plan includes anticipated draws against this reserve in the amount of \$1.25M for operations and \$1.2M for capital expenditures. The 2014 contribution from the Province of Ontario, the reserve funds sole funding source, is estimated at \$2M. With these items taken into account, and before consideration of the recommendations in this report, the uncommitted reserve fund balance at the end of 2014 is estimated to be \$4.5M.
- 62. If approved as presented, the recommendations in this report would result in defined additional one-time draws against the reserve fund of \$125K for the 5yr Transit Business Plan and \$25K for the Transit Communications Plan. An additional estimated draw of \$900K will be required to make up the anticipated revenue shortfall for the year. The total financial impact is an estimated draw of \$1.05M over-and-above the 2014 plan.

# The City of BARRIE

# STAFF REPORT FACTR002-14

May 05, 2014

Page: 10 File: C11-TRA Pending #:

63. The recommendations contained in this report will result in approximately \$900K in additional draws from the PGT Reserve Fund to support ongoing operations. Generally, ongoing operating costs should be funded from ongoing revenue sources as a matter of sustainability. However, in this instance the draw is intended to address only the anticipated shortfall for 2014 before the funding plan for Transit operations is reassessed in its entirety for the P3 agreement and 5yr Transit Business Plan.

### **LINKAGE TO 2010-2014 COUNCIL STRATEGIC PLAN**

- 64. The recommendation(s) included in this Staff Report support the following goals identified in the 2010-2014 City Council Strategic Plan:
  - Manage Growth & Protect the Environment
  - Improve & Expand Community Involvement and City Interactions.
- 65. To best meet the needs of a growing community focused on intensification, transit services will continue to grow in importance and user expectations for expanded transportation choices and improved services.
- 66. The continued expansion and use of technology will enable customers to stay connected to Barrie's transit service and foster ongoing interactions between the customer, the service provider, and City staff. .



May 05, 2014 *Appendix "A"*  Page: 12 File: C11-TRA Pending #:

## **Public Feedback Themes**

Public Feedback Themes						
Proposed Route Changes: Themes from Feedback						
Proposed Route number or Service Area	Feedback/ Comments	RESULTS				
Route 1	Route needs to run on time and requires more frequency to get from downtown to the mall.  Needs to start earlier and run later so people can get to and from work.  Route 2 should service Walmart and Park Place this would reduce the inconvenience of a transfer on Mapleview.	- The request for additional service hours for earlier start and increased service levels for greater frequency are not being addressed as part of these route revisions as this will increase expenditures This feedback has been received and incorporated as				
Route 3	to go to Park Place.  - Bring service to South End Plaza at the corner of Yonge	part of routes identified in Appendix "B" - This feedback has been				
	and Big Bay Pointe Road.  - Direct connection from Hurst drive to Innisdale High school and Allandale Recreation Centre - Return service to Grove Street at Cook as the distance to walk to the nearest route in too far.	received and incorporated as part of routes identified in Appendix "B"				
Route 4	Ensure route starts early enough to allow for earlier GO train connections.     This route should offer a direct connection to East Bayfield Community Centre.     please bring service back to Springdale to bridge the gap between Bayfield street and St Vincent	The request for earlier service hours were not considered as part of these revisions as early morning service was cut by Council as part of the business plan in 2013 and would increase annual operational costs.      Other feedback identified was incorporated as part of the routes in Appendix "B" of this report.				
Route 5	- Eliminate proposed peak service portion and leave service at current full day service - service in NorthEast end of City appears to have less coverage and requires longer walks to reach service areas Desire to have Grocery run as a permanent portion of a route Do not remove service from Nelson	- Each comment as been taking into consideration and resulted in changes to the routes removing only peak service for route 5, incorporating the grocery special into a permanent route, and servicing additional coverage area in the Northeast end of the City				
Route 6	Route 6 should go into RVH to allow for passengers from the NorthWest end of the City to make direct trips for medical appointments.	<ul> <li>Due to the current proposed length of Route 6 it would not have sufficient time to make the additional stop at RVH and still maintain on-time service reliability.</li> </ul>				
Route 7	<ul> <li>This route should remain as it is today with connectivity to the Commerce Park industrial area.</li> <li>Earlier and later service to better serve south employment and shopping lands.</li> </ul>	hours were not considered as				
Route 8	- "Needs to be ON TIME" - Improved service reliability Needs to start earlier and run later to allow for connections to work places Route is too long - Later peak service frequency	- The planning methodology used this time around has built in additional measures to help increase on-time service reliability Scheduling efforts will be made to ensure Route 8 operates with later and earlier service hours while maintain current operating costs. Any additional service increase that requires additional operating dollars were not considered as part of these revisions.				
Lockhart	Requesting service in the area of Lockhart road subdivision near Huronia, we are tax payers and have the right to public tranist a stop at Huronia and Lockhart would be a start!	- Based on the costing to offer this service with a dedicated route would exceed \$300k, therefore staff are investigating the implimentation of a "dial a ride" service for this area which would require ridders to schedule a trip from their house to the nearest sheltered stop on the Transit system.				
General- all routes	GO connectivity- do not lose focus on GO stations and the many people who commute daily for work and school/ make sure schedules line up with early trains and late evenings Changes Welcome! Great job looking forward to the changes.	- Greater coordination with GO scheduling and connectivity will be taken into consideration when developing the schedules for this new service.				



May 05, 2014 Appendix "B" Page: 13 File: C11-TRA Pending #:

## **2014 Proposed Routes**

