



TO: GENERAL COMMITTEE

SUBJECT: TRANSFER OF POLICE DOWNTOWN CAMERAS

WARD: 2

PREPARED BY AND KEY CONTACT: R. NOLAN, DIRECTOR OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY, EXTENSION 4373

SUBMITTED BY: R. NOLAN, DIRECTOR OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY, EXTENSION 4373

GENERAL MANAGER APPROVAL: R. BUNN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF INNOVATE BARRIE

CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER APPROVAL: M. PROWSE, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

RECOMMENDED MOTION

1. That City of Barrie Information Technology Department not take over the Downtown Camera System.
2. That the City's contribution to the Barrie Police Service in 2019 be increased by \$265,000 (capital and operating cost), to be allocated as follows:
 - a) \$225,000 be contributed to the Barrie Police Service Capital Reserve for use in 2020 and 2021 for the replacement of the downtown cameras; and
 - b) \$45,000 for costs associated with the 2019 operations and maintenance of the downtown cameras.

PURPOSE & BACKGROUND

Report Overview

3. On September 17th 2018 City Council adopted motion 18-G-181 regarding BARRIE POLICE SERVICES BOARD RECOMMENDATION TO TRANSFER DOWNTOWN BARRIE CAMERAS TO THE CITY'S INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DEPARTMENT as follows:

"That the correspondence from the Barrie Police Services Board dated June 25, 2018 regarding the Board's recommendation to transfer the downtown cameras to the City of Barrie Information Technology Department be referred to staff in the Information Technology Department for a report back to General Committee prior to or as part of the 2019 Business Plan that outlines potential options related to the request as well as the financial, administrative and operational implications for both the City of Barrie and the Barrie Police Service."

Background

4. On November 28, 2011 Council approved motion 11-G-343 for the installation of cameras to improve the safety of the downtown core. In 2012 the Barrie Police Service commissioned 10 camera locations, with some of the locations having multiple lenses, for a total of 15 video feeds today. See Appendix A for a map showing the camera locations.
5. In 2017, video evidence from the downtown cameras was used 48 times, or averaging nearly once per week. The cameras are a good source of evidence and according to representatives of Barrie Police Service, help to deter crime in the downtown core.
6. The cameras are nearly 6 years old and should be replaced soon. With camera technology, at the 5+ years mark, the risk of hardware failure begins to significantly increase year over year. Some degradation, or complete loss, in pan tilt zoom (PTZ) capabilities has already occurred, and increased maintenance is required for the moving parts of the camera system.
7. Interest has been expressed to expand coverage to additional areas around the downtown Public Library and Meridian Square. Although expansion of the system is not covered in the scope of this investigation.

ANALYSIS

8. The Information Technology department, in consultation with department stakeholders, investigated three options.
 - a) Barrie Police Services continue to maintain the program as it is today
 - b) City's IT department manages the cameras and connectivity. Barrie Police Services manage the video recordings
 - c) City's IT department owns and hosts the surveillance system and Police access the systems
9. Having Barrie Police Service continue to maintain the Downtown Camera System has the least administrative and operational implication overall.

Privacy and Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy (MFIPPA) Implications

10. The City is required to comply with MFIPPA with respect to information that falls under the definition of personal information. Section 2(1) of MFIPPA defines "personal information" as "recorded information about an identifiable individual," which includes, but is not limited to, "information relating to the race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, age [or] sex" of the individual. The downtown cameras do collect personal information.
11. Section 28(2) of MFIPPA sets out the conditions under which personal information may be collected. This section provides that no person shall collect personal information on behalf of an institution, unless the collection is:
 - a) Expressly authorized by statute,
 - b) Used for the purposes of law enforcement or
 - c) Necessary to the proper administration of a lawfully authorized activity.

At least one of these three conditions must be met to have the legal authority to collect personal information. The Information and Privacy Commission of Ontario's (IPC) position regarding "used for the purpose of law enforcement", is the institution must have a clear law enforcement mandate, as per the definition of "law enforcement" in section 2(1) of MFIPPA. Barrie Police Service has such a mandate.

12. MFIPPA prohibits the disclosure of personal information, except in the circumstances identified in section 32 of MFIPPA. If the downtown camera system were operated by a City department, additional privacy and legal considerations would define how, and in what circumstances that Barrie Police Service may access any of the recordings. These City requirements would be above and beyond Barrie Police Services existing procedures for accessing surveillance videos as the City is not a law enforcement institution. This would increase the amount of work and resources required to access the video feeds or recordings.

Operational Implications (Policies and Governance)

13. The Barrie Police Service adopted a policy generally reflecting the Information and Privacy Commissioner of Ontario's Guidelines for the Use of Video Surveillance of Public Places by Police and Law Enforcement Agencies dated September 2007, prior to the implementation of the downtown security cameras/video surveillance system.
14. Barrie Police Service's Public Video Surveillance System procedure governs any access to, and control of, personal information attained by video surveillance. The procedure also ensures reasonable measures to prevent unauthorized access as well as inadvertent destruction or damage of records in compliance with section 3 of Regulation 823 of MFIPPA.
15. For the City to take over the Downtown Cameras, the City would need to have a counterpart to the Barrie Police Service resources managing requests to the current system. These resources are for fulfilling requests, from Barrie Police Service or members of the public. The City's threshold for rights of access is different than law enforcement agencies, resulting in additional requests that must be responded to.
16. Under the proposed recommendation, governance over the use, expansion or contraction of the program will remain with the Barrie Police Service. The City may provide feedback from citizens and businesses regarding the camera system, however changes would continue to be the responsibility of Barrie Police Service. As well, Barrie Police Service would be responsible for ensuring compliance with any legislative changes and/or updated guidance from IPC.

Summary of Options Investigated

17. The following is a high level summary of the options that were investigated and the implications associated with each:

Option	Pros	Cons	Other comments
Barrie Police Service continues to maintain the program as it is today	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Barrie Police Service is able to continue current processes for the collection and management of evidence without additional steps Governance over the use, expansion or contraction of the program remains with the Barrie Police Service Reduces risk to the City of Barrie as it doesn't have clear authority to collect personal information for law enforcement purposes 	Barrie Police Service does not currently have sufficient funds in its operating budget to manage the cameras or funds to replace cameras at end of life.	As neither the IT department nor the Barrie Police Service's budget request include funds for replacement and maintenance/management of the downtown cameras, it is proposed that Barrie Police Service be provided with both the operating and capital funds to properly manage the cameras and their replacement
City's IT department manages the cameras and connectivity. Barrie Police Services manage the video recordings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Limits the City's risk and liability to an extent as the City would not be responsible for the records created. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Supporting the cameras and connectivity would require IT staff resources to manage. IT estimates approximately 0.2 of an FTE (Technical Analyst) for the initial replacement work. Followed by approximately 0.1 of an FTE (Technical Analyst) for on-going support and maintenance of the cameras and connectivity. This includes the vendor and 	The proposed recommendation would not require additional City staff resources to support the replacement of the cameras and provide on-going support and maintenance. It also provides Barrie Police Service with the necessary resources to replace the equipment and provide for on-going support of the cameras.

		<p>contract management.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Additional to the soft costs above, IT estimates \$225,000 capital and \$45,000 on-going operating to support the cameras and connectivity back to Barrie Police Services 	
City's IT department owns and hosts the surveillance system and Police access the systems		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Additional risk to the City of Barrie associated with the collection of personal information as a non-law enforcement agency • Resources required in IT and potentially in Records and Information Management to manage the video recordings and any access requests for the records. 	<p>The proposed recommendation would not require additional City staff resources to support the replacement of the cameras and provide on-going support and maintenance. It also provides Barrie Police Service with the necessary resources to replace the equipment and provide for on-going support of the cameras.</p>

ENVIRONMENTAL MATTERS

18. There are no environmental matters related to the recommendation.

ALTERNATIVES

19. The following alternatives are available for consideration by General Committee:

Alternative #1

General Committee could alter the proposed recommendation by having the City's Information Technology Department replace and manage the cameras and connectivity back to Barrie Police Service.

Although this alternative is available, supporting the cameras and connectivity would require IT staff resources to manage. IT estimates approximately 0.2 of an FTE (Technical Analyst) for the initial replacement work. Followed by approximately 0.1 of an FTE (Technical Analyst) for on-going support and maintenance of the cameras and connectivity. This includes the vendor and contract management.

Additional to the soft costs above, IT estimates \$225,000 capital and \$45,000 on-going operating to support the cameras and connectivity back to Barrie Police Services.

Alternative #2

General Committee could alter the proposed recommendation by having the City's Information Technology Department host and own the surveillance system.

This alternative is not recommended as increases to City staff will be required to meet the City's additional MFIPPA obligations. It would also involve additional steps for Barrie Police Service to access a valuable source of evidence.

FINANCIAL

20. The major work on Dunlop Street scheduled to begin in fall 2019 provides an opportunity to incorporate new cameras into the overall design of the space. Any work on the camera replacements should be coordinated with the Dunlop Street project.
21. Total capital required to replace the downtown cameras that are at or approaching end of life - \$225,000
- a) This includes camera hardware, connectivity hardware, cabling, installation and commissioning the cameras
22. Total operating required to support the cameras and connectivity back to Barrie Police Service - \$45,000
- a) This include break fix, network circuits and connectivity costs, cabling, as well as licensing and maintenance required for all the equipment.

LINKAGE TO 2018-2022 STRATEGIC PLAN

23. The recommendation(s) included in this Staff Report are not specifically related to the goals identified in the 2018-2022 Strategic Plan.

APPENDIX "A"

Downtown Camera Locations

