

BARRIE-SIMCOE EMERGENCY SERVICES CAMPUS – Q & A #2 – June 15, 2017

Costs by Building

1. Q: What is the breakdown of costs by building in the current IPD Validation Report?

A: The following table breaks down project costs for each building and sitework, as proposed in the Validation Report for the Campus:

Element	
Building A	\$71,788,578.87
Building B	\$20,977,306.75
Building C	\$2,746,703.82
Sitework	\$13,437,573.43
Total	\$108,950,162.87

The above costs include City and County soft costs, and exclude the land and financing costs.

2. Q: What would the cost be for Building A, B and C if the project were phased?

A: Choosing to build only a portion of the Campus buildings will result in lost economies of scale, and result in higher upfront and future phasing costs for the City.

The below table represents the breakdown of costs for constructing Building A now, and deferring Building B and/or C from the Campus:

Element	
Building A + Sitework	\$91,681,338.16
Building B (PHASED)	\$22,182,224.19
Building C (PHASED)	\$3,822,347.64
Total	\$117,685,909.99

The above phased costs do not include inflation (3% per year) or the cost increase of tendering as a traditional contract (10-15% higher than IPD).

Proceeding with only Building A will cost \$91M including sitework (\$6.5M higher than Building A + Sitework when completed as part of the IPD Contract).

Site

3. Q: If we were to take out building # 2 and 3 and only build building # 1, would you still need and want to buy the land?

A: If Building A & B were phased, yes we would still recommend purchasing the land, to ensure the ability to phase future buildings. The City does not own any land in that centrally located area of the City, and the piece of land identified is best-suited for the Campus.

Post Disaster Building

4. Q: Is all of Building A truly required to be post disaster?

A: Yes, all components in Building A are required to be post disaster. Throughout the post disaster review process, the team looked at legislative requirements set out in the Ontario Building Code alongside guidelines from the Ontario Architects Association, and operational requirements set out in The Police Services Act of Ontario and Adequacy Standards.

5. Are there components in Building A not required to be post disaster that could be moved someplace else, with either a tunnel or bridge connection?

A: No, this is not recommended. The team has looked at tunnels and bridges during the design process and the concept presented, with 3 buildings, is the most cost-effective option.

In a true disaster situation it is important that lockers, fitness, and lunch rooms are located in the post disaster building, as they have been designed with proximity to the staff entrance for effective emergency response and support for officers and staff. These spaces will serve multi-purposes during a disaster to ensure operations are not compromised, with the flexibility to be set up as meeting/triage/staging areas. Lockers are needed for sworn officers, paramedics, and response teams to turn out in uniform, and allow officers to “refresh” between longer shifts.

6. Q: What criteria are used for determining Post Disaster?

A: From the Ontario Building Code, “a post disaster building means a building that is essential to the provision of services in the event of a disaster, and includes:

- (a) hospitals, emergency treatment facilities and blood banks,
- (b) telephone exchanges,
- (c) power generating stations and electrical substations,
- (d) control centres for land transportation,
- (e) public water treatment and storage facilities,
- (f) water and sewage pumping stations,
- (g) emergency response facilities,**
- (h) fire, rescue and police stations,**
- (i) storage facilities for vehicles or boats used for fire, rescue and police purposes, and**
- (j) communications facilities, including radio and television stations.”**

When considering post disaster, the requirement extends beyond seismic disaster for our area, and includes major weather events such as tornados, winter storms and snowfall.

Fire Training

7. Q: What are your thoughts on building " B ", (training facility), being built with the new fire station in the S/E .

I understand the building has more services then just fire. I would like to know if there would be enough land to accommodate the fire training.

A: The new fire station 6 planned in the southeast Hewitt's secondary plan will be a scaled back version from what was originally requested in the Fire Master Plan, and therefore on an even smaller site (2.5 acres) than a typical fire station (4 acres). Chief Boyes has closely examined and scaled back the station designs. The 2.5 acre site for station 6 is enough only for a small station and would be too small to accommodate any of the Campus' Building B facility or site components, which in the Thomas Brown study, identified the need for 12 acres to accommodate the indoor and outdoor aspects of the training facility for BFES.

Data / Figures from Past Reports

8. The building areas and phasing presented here appear to be different than those outlined in the 2013 staff report.

Can staff provide a conversion from square meters to square feet and identify the difference between what is presented here and what was outlined in the 2013 report?

These areas look specific – can staff please review the old files and identify what the intent was?

A: Two areas were included in the 2013 staff report motion:

- 7,450 m² (80,200 ft²) in phase 1 to be completed by 2019, and
- 4,650 m² (50,000 ft²) to be completed by 2027.

Staff have been unable to find any other reference to these two areas in various consulting reports and are not able to confirm how they were derived.

Communication with Rebanks subsequent to the release of the 2013 report suggests that the numbers may have been presented in error. Given that the areas and costs indicated in the motion do not match those shown in paragraph 31 of Staff Report RFT006-13, and are different again from the areas included in Appendix E of the same report, an error seems likely.

We do know that a 2008 Facilities Needs Assessment Study completed for Barrie Police Service recommended a single new facility, as this would best serve the facility needs and operational requirements of the force, and that the recommended facility size at the time was 130,000 ft². The estimated cost of the facility recommended in 2008 was \$45.3M, excluding a range. This equates to approximately \$59M in today's dollars. The report did not recommend phasing or constructing *Second or District* stations due to the loss of functional advantages and increased operational costs. The report was also created prior to the acquisition of the annexed lands and the proposed facility will only accommodate a portion of the growth now expected.

The values presented in the motion from Staff Report RFT006-13 do not appear to be based on any previous work completed for the campus (although the combined areas do match that recommended in the 2008 report) and indeed conflict with supporting document referenced by the report. While staff today can confirm that project phasing was intended we are unable to identify what the intent of these values was, if any.

Staff Report RFT006-13 does identify the need to phase the project given the preliminary nature of long-term planning numbers. In both cases, the purpose of including additional phase(s) is to ensure a sufficient enough parcel of land is purchased to accommodate current and future needs. RFT006-13 omits any area or costs associated with future phases.

Areas and Costs for Multi-Service Campus from RFT006-13

For reference, the areas and costs for Barrie Police Service indicated in paragraph 31 of the staff report are as follows:

Estimated First Responder's Campus Development Costs						
Component	Police HQ	EMS Hub	RP&F Admin	RP&F Vehicles	Classrooms & Training Space	Totals
Capital Costs						
Gross Building Area	10,100 m ²	2,300 m ²	2,205 m ²	2,300 m ²	3,140 m ²	20,045 m ²
Cost per square metre	\$3,230	\$3,000	\$2,600	\$2,300	\$2,600	
Building Costs	\$32,623,000	\$6,900,000	\$5,733,000	\$5,290,000	\$8,164,000	\$58,710,000
Firing Range						\$3,300,000
Shared Site Assets						\$1,410,000
Shared Site Development						\$4,235,000
Total Estimated Constr. Costs						\$67,655,000
Project Soft Costs (30%)						\$20,297,000
Total Campus Costs						\$87,952,000

Source: Staff Report RFT006-13 (13-G-145), paragraph 31, June 10, 2013

Although these values are not supported by reference documents, based on the table above the required police area should have been referenced as 10,100 m² for the Police HQ, plus some portion of the shared classroom and training space, plus the unidentified area of the range.

Assuming the police shared space allocation is proportional to their HQ space on the campus (50%), this would equate to a police gross building area of 11,670 m² plus the area of the range. The total police cost in 2013 dollars based on this table would therefore be \$55,675,750 + HST. This equates to approximately \$62.7M in 2017 dollars.

The campus as presented includes a police area of 13,721 m² including the \$9.5M firing range at a total police cost of \$71.9M

Areas and Costs from Rebanks, Pepper, Littlewood Multi-Services Report (April 10, 2013)

As noted above, the 2013 MultiServices Campus Report developed by Rebanks Littlewood Pepper and Associates that formed the basis of Staff Report RFT006-13 and which is also partially included in Appendix E of RFT006-13, indicated very different numbers, recommending a total police area of 16,330 m² (175,775 ft²) including a 1,000 m² firearms range within a 27,375 m² (294,660 ft², \$115.8M) Campus.

It should be noted that the 1,000 m² firing range area indicated in the Rebanks report is based on 25m firing lanes that do not meet the upcoming provincial standard for proficiency training. The range proposed as part of the Barrie Simcoe Emergency Services Campus includes 50m training lanes.

3.3.2 City of Barrie and County of Simcoe Multi-Services Campus – No Fire						
Component	Police HQ	EMS Hub	RP&F Admin	RP&F Vehicles	Training Centre	Totals
Capital Costs						
Gross Building Area	15,330m ²	2,300 m ²	2,205m ²	2,300m ²	4,240m ²	26,375 m²
Cost per square metre	\$3,230	\$3,000	\$2,600	\$2,300	\$2,600	-
Building Costs	\$49,500,000	\$6,900,000	\$5,700,000	\$5,300,000	\$11,000,000	\$78,400,000
Firing Range						\$4,500,000
Shared Site Assets						\$1,550,000
Shared Site Develop.						\$4,600,000
Total Est. Constr. Costs						\$89,050,000
Project Soft Costs (30%)						\$26,715,000
Total Campus Costs						\$115,765,000

Source: Barrie Municipal MultiServices Campus Opportunities, Rebanks Pepper Littlewood Architects, April 10, 2013